

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

IN RE: ETHICON, INC. PELVIC REPAIR  
SYSTEMS PRODUCTS LIABILITY  
LITIGATION

Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327  
MDL 2327

---

ETHICON NON-REVISION PTO 298  
(ELECTION WAVE) CASES LISTED IN  
EXHIBIT A OF DEFENSE NOTICE OF  
ADOPTION

JOSEPH R. GOODWIN  
U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE

**NOTICE OF ADOPTION OF PRIOR DAUBERT RESPONSE OF  
ABBAS SHOBEIRI, M.D. FOR NON-REVISION PTO 298 (ELECTION WAVE)**

Comes now, the Plaintiffs, and hereby adopt and incorporate by reference the Daubert response filed in relation to Abbas Shobeiri, M.D., for Ethicon Wave 1, Dkt. 2170, and Wave 3, Dkt. 2956. Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court deny Defendants' motion, for the reasons expressed in the Wave 1 and Wave 3 response briefing.

Dated: December 20, 2018

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ D. Renee Baggett \_\_\_\_\_  
Renee Baggett, Esq.  
Bryan F. Aylstock, Esq.  
Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis and Overholtz, PLC  
17 East Main Street, Suite 200  
Pensacola, Florida 32563  
(850) 202-1010  
(850) 916-7449 (fax)  
E-mail: [rbaggett@awkolaw.com](mailto:rbaggett@awkolaw.com)

/s/ Thomas P. Cartmell \_\_\_\_\_  
THOMAS P. CARTMELL  
Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP  
4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300  
Kansas City, MO 64112  
816-701-1102  
Fax 816-531-2372  
[tcartmell@wcllp.com](mailto:tcartmell@wcllp.com)

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on December 20, 2018, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the court using CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ D. Renee Baggett \_\_\_\_\_  
D. RENEE BAGGETT  
Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis and Overholtz, PLC  
17 E. Main Street, Suite 200  
Pensacola, FL 32563  
850-202-1010  
850-916-7449  
[Rbaggett@awkolaw.com](mailto:Rbaggett@awkolaw.com)